TRINA A. HIGGINS, United States Attorney (#7349)
ANGELA JEAN CLIFFORD, Assistant United States Attorney (#17485)
PETER REICHMAN, Special Assistant United States Attorney (#15241)
Attorneys for the United States of America
Office of the United States Attorney
111 South Main Street, Suite 1800
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111-2176
Telephone: (801) 524-5682

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF UTAH

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	Case No. 2:23-cr-00365 TC
Plaintiff,	THIRD NOTICE OF COMPLIANCE
VS.	AND REQUEST FOR RECIPROCAL DISCOVERY
RITHY CHHAK and VALENE STEPHANIE SMITH,	
Defendants.	Judge Tena Campbell

The United States of America, by and through the undersigned, hereby files its third notice of compliance with its discovery obligations in this case and request for reciprocal discovery from the defendants.

The United States gives notice that the following is being or has been provided to counsel for the defendants:

Description	Bates Numbers
Body Cam, Photographs, Spreadsheets, and Reports uploaded to USAfx (NOC 3)	See attached discovery index

Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(4)(A) of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, the United States notified the defense that at trial, the United States may seek to use all physical evidence, statements made by the defendant and others, police reports, phone records, electronic evidence

(including body camera footage), documents, and photographs obtained during the investigation. The United States reserves the right to introduce in its case-in-chief all tangible objects, physical, documentary, and electronic evidence, and all other evidence provided, made available, or identified in discovery.

As additional discoverable material becomes available, such material will be provided within a reasonable time. Throughout this case, the United States will provide material discoverable under Rules 16 and 26.2 of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure and the Jencks Act without requiring the defendant to make a specific request for such material. Upon the request of the defendant, the United States will permit and facilitate the defendant's own inspection, copying or photographing of those items described/defined in Rule 16(a)(1)(E).

The United States also hereby requests disclosure of evidence by the defendant (also known as reciprocal discovery) pursuant to Rule 16(b) of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure and DUCrimR 16-1(c). By providing Rule 16 discovery without requiring a specific request from the defense, the United States invokes a reciprocal obligation on the defendant under DUCrimR 16-1(c), which states that the defendant must allow the government to inspect and to copy the following, as further defined in Rule 16 of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure:

- Documents and tangible objects the defendant intends to introduce as evidence at trial;
- Reports of examinations and tests the defendant intends to introduce at trial or that were prepared by a witness whom the defendant intends to call at trial; and

c. A written summary of the testimony of any expert the defendant intends to

use a trial under Federal Rules of Evidence 702, 703 and 705.

The United States requests that the defendant provide to the government at a reasonable time before trial, but no later than five working days before trial, copies of the material referenced in this paragraph. Further, the United States requests continuing compliance with the reciprocal

The United States also hereby requests all written and recorded statements by any witness other than the defendant whom the defendant intends to call at trial or a hearing covered by the Jencks Act or Rule 26.2 of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure.

DATED this 29th day of January, 2024.

discovery following the initial disclosure.

TRINA A. HIGGINS United States Attorney

/s/ Angela Jean Clifford
ANGELA JEAN CLIFFORD
Assistant United States Attorney

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on the 29<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2024, the Third CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE AND REQUEST FOR RECIPROCAL DISCOVERY was filed electronically to the District Court, and caused to be made available for download from USAfx, to the following:

Scott C. Williams SCOTT C WILLIAMS LLC 43 East 400 South Salt Lake City, UT 84111 Telephone: (801) 220-0700 Email: <a href="mailto:scwlegal@gmail.com">scwlegal@gmail.com</a> Counsel for Rithy Chhak

Nathan K. Phelps Federal Public Defender - District of Utah 46 W Broadway, Ste 110 Salt Lake City, UT 84101 Telephone: (801) 524-4010 Email: nathan\_phelps@fd.org

Counsel for Valene Smith

/s/ Ingrid Westphal-Kelson Ingrid Westphal-Kelson Paralegal Specialist

## 

## US v. RITHY CHHAK, ET AL. DISCOVERY INDEX

CATEGORY	FOLDER NAME	DESCRIPTION	BATES BEGIN	BATES END	NOC
Body Cams	Taylorsville PD	Body Cam footage - Video (Produced in Native Format)	BWC-01-00003	BWC-01-00004	3
	Taylorsville PD	Body Cam footage - Audio (Produced in Native Format)	BWC-01-00005	BWC-01-00010	3
Investigative	Taylorsville PD	Taylorsville PD Report, GO# TY 2023-27302	INV-TPD-01-00005	INV-TPD-01-00005.20	3
	Taylorsville PD	Taylorsville PD Report, GO# TY 2023-27883 (page 12 of report, unredacted)	INV-TPD-01-00001.15	INV-TPD-01-00001.15	3
UBFS UBFS	UBFS	Utah Bureau of Forensic Services, Forensic Analysis Report - Controlled Substance Analysis	INV-UBFS-01-00001	INV-UBFS-01-00001.02	3
	UBFS	Utah Bureau of Forensic Services, NIBIN Correspondence	INV-UBFS-01-00002	INV-UBFS-01-00002.04	3
<b>Photographs</b>	Taylorsville PD	Photographs of evidence	PH-01-00108	PH-01-00110	3
Search Warrants	Warrant No. 2708451	Acura history 8-18-23 to 8-23-23 spreadsheet (Produced in Native Format)	SW-01-00004	SW-01-00004	3
	Warrant No. 2708451	Acura history 8-18-23 to 8-23-23 spreadsheet (Produced in Native Format)	SW-01-00005	SW-01-00005	3
	Warrant No. 2708451	Acura history 8-18-23 to 8-23-23 spreadsheet (Produced in Native Format)	SW-01-00006	SW-01-00006	3
	Warrant No. 2708451	Evidence Report SBI spreadsheet (Produced in Native Format)	SW-01-00007	SW-01-00007	3